Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

#### **Minutes**

Preparatory working group and monitoring working group meeting of Pasvik-Inari Trilateral Park 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2009, Zapoljarny, Russia

Russian party:

Vladimir Chizhov, Natalia Polikarpova, Olga Makarova, Marina Trusova (Pasvik Reserve) Elvira Makarova (Ministry for natural resources and ecology of Murmansk region, attendee instead of Alexey Smirnov Lubov Timokhina (Mayor of Nikel)

Norwegian party:

Tiia Kalske (Department on Environmental Affairs, County Governor of Finnmark, Vadsø) Ingvild Wartiainen, Paul Aspholm (Bioforsk Svanhovd)
Trygve Sarajärvi (Sør-Varanger municipality, town of Kirkenes)
Kurt Wikan (Pasvikturist tourist agency)

Finnish party:

Jyrki Tolonen, Tapio Tynys, Riina Tervo (Metsähallitus Natural Heritage Services) Päivi Lundvall (Lapland Regional Environment Centre, city of Rovaniemi)

### Other attendees:

Marina Kovtun (Department for economic development and tourism of Murmansk region) Vladimir Matveev (Border guards, town of Nikel) Pirkko Mäkikokkila (Finnish Consul General, city of Murmansk)

Interpreter: Elena Babina (Russian-English)

## Absent members:

Pekka Sulkava (Metsähallitus Natural Heritage Services) Bente Christiansen (Environment Department, Finnmark County Governor Office) Inari municipality

04/03/2009, 09-13:00 Moscow time

A preparatory group meeting and a monitoring group meeting were held on March 3, 2009 prior to the Advisory Board meeting.

The following decisions were taken by the working group on monitoring:

It was decided by the parties that the chair country within the framework of the Trilateral Park would preside during the meetings of all working groups and would appoint a secretary who would keep all the minutes.

The parties were informed about short-term monitoring plans in the period from 2009 till 2011 under the Action Plan – the main management directive. The brown bear, the golden eagle and waterbirds are target monitoring species in 2009.

The parties exchanged information on ENPI – instrument and prospects for funding of new projects in 2009. At present the funding of joint projects depends on signing of a Treaty between Russia and EU, it is scheduled for May.









Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

Olga Makarova: Pasvik Reserve has made a proposal to have a joint monitoring of domesticated reindeer and their impact on the Specially Protected Nature Territories as well as research of lichen and pastures. It is connected with the stay of Norwegian reindeer in the Russian part of the reserve which is prohibited under the Russian legislation in force. The question is socially oriented. The Russian party suggests having it as a separate project or a project within the framework of the Park.

Tiia Kalske: The Norwegian reindeer authority in cooperation with the reindeer herders association in Pasvik area is in the process of planning to build a fence to prohibit reindeer from Norway to pass over the border to Russia. The position of the fence is not yet decided, impact studies have been done, and different alternative positions are under discussion in the process.

Olga Makarova: According to the Russian party the fence will be inefficient as it will interfere with migration of other big animals. It will be efficient to drive reindeer to other pastures, farther from Pasvik Reserve. All the parties agree that there is such a problem and express their readiness to support the Russian party to solve it by means of organizing a trilateral meeting with the reindeer herders and specialists.

Vladimir Chizhov: The reserve will set the date and inform the partners about it.

Jyrki Tolonen: The Finnish party will pay attention to the preparation of Interreg programme in 2009. Only the golden eagle will be monitored due to no funding for monitoring of waterbirds and the brown bear.

Paul Aspholm: Norway will not monitor the brown bear in Pasvik-Inari area but in the other areas of Finnmark (Anarjokka) as the population of the brown bear has been studied rather well in Pasvik.

Ingvild Wartiainen: But Bioforsk Svanhovd has money to make DNA analysis of hair samples and scats in the event that Russian and Finnish colleagues deliver them.

Paul Aspholm: Water bird registration will take place twice in spring and once in autumn in cooperation with Pasvik Reserve.

Tiia Kalske: Golden eagle monitoring is carried out by NINA institute on the Barents Sea coast, not in Pasvik area.

Natalia Polikarpova: The Russian partner will inactively collect bear faeces and deliver them to Bioforsk Svanhovd in case that there will be no funding provided. There will be waterbird registration but there will be no golden eagle monitoring as the specialist has been away this year. The Reserve will also equip a forest monitoring station under ICP-Forests programme together with Russian and Finnish specialists. The Reserve will take part in Pasvik programme in case of its commencement.

The parties discussed Lake Inari regulation. Vladimir Chizhov: The Reserve would like to take part in the meeting of the Mixed commission on this issue as regulation of Lake Inari and the Paz River has a direct impact on the ecological systems of the reserve. The parties concluded that it would be necessary to cooperate with the power companies of three countries. Olga Makarova: There is a problem of HEP stations renovation in Russia, as well as law imperfection, there are alien species such as the vendace (*Coregonus albula*), the muskrat and artificial fish propagation.









Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

The representatives of the park should participate in the ecological expertise of HEP stations renovation. Päivi Lundvall: The Finnish party has promised to assist in it.

Natalia Polikarpova: Long-term monitoring programmes will be renewed in office and forwarded to the partners by e-mail for a further discussion.

# The following decisions were taken by the preparatory working group:

The group will work in 2009.

The resolutions are prepared and then discussed at a meeting after that they are presented to the Advisory Board.

It is necessary to follow up some of the recommendations made by the EUROPARC verifiers, f. ex make small adjustments/ amendments to the Plan of Action based on the recommendations made by the EUROPARC verification commission (Tiia Kalske will make proposals and circulate).

- 1. To clarify the key notions such as a core area, a buffer zone and transit zone.
- 2. To clarify the goal vision regarding natural, cultural and historic values.
- 3. To clarify all weaknesses and to find a possibility to reduce/to liquidate them (joint).
- 4. To intensify exchange of information on water regulation in Paz-Inari region.
- 5. The internationally recognised terms are used by EUROPARC, one should study EUROPARCstandards and add them as an attachment to the Action Plan.
- 6. To make amendments to the Action Plan, Part B regarding strategies and actions in order to demonstrate their practical orientation and to plan a future application for funding (Natalia Polikarpova is in charge).

Finland develops criteria for making a film about Pasvik-Inari region and forwards them to the partners for discussion prior to the following meeting (Tapio Tynys is in charge). The film should be produced in Finnish, Norwegian, Russian and English. The Russian party will promote picture taking in the cross border area if it is necessary. The parties will organize a meeting of experts to plan a new project after receiving information on funding. The date and the place of the meeting will be set later.

It will be a new two-year project; the Finnish party will act as coordinator.

Pasvik Reserve will undertake actions to organize a meeting of reindeer herders, representatives of the trilateral park and other stakeholders to discuss the issue of the stay of Norwegian domesticated reindeer in the Russian part of Pasvik Reserve and a grazing monitoring plan (Vladimir Chizhov is in charge). The Reserve will set a convenient date and place of the meeting, and inform the partners about it.

A meeting of nature tourism group will take place in September 2009 in Russia. It will be possible to discuss some issues aimed at remedying the remarks made by the EUROPARC verification commission and to update the Action Plan.

These decisions have been reflected in work of the Advisory Board.

# Agenda of the Advisory Board meeting

- 1. Opening, quorum
- 2. Signing of the protocol of the previous meeting
- 3. Short-term priority actions under the Action Plan
- 4. Plan correction in accordance with the recommendations made by the EUROPARC verifiers
- 5. New monitoring projects, their planning and funding









Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

- 6. Dissemination of information: priorities and proposals
- 7. Future projects and actions
- 8. Date and place of the next Advisory Board meeting
- 9. Date and place of the next meeting of the nature tourism group
- 10. Exchange of information on the status of the region
- 11. Miscellaneous items

## 1.

Vladimir Chizhov welcomed everybody at the first meeting of the Advisory Board after the EUROPARC certificate had been awarded. He introduced new participants to the audience. The quorum was reached.

**2.** The parties signed the protocol of the Advisory Board meeting held on September 3 and September 4, 2008 in Svanvik, Norway.

3.

Natalia Polikarpova made a presentation and dwelled on the main actions that should be implemented in 1-3 years under the Action Plan. She paid attention to Strategies 1-14 of the Action Plan. Some of them have already been implemented, some are being implemented and some of them will be implemented in the future.

Medium – term plans need to be considered and added to the new projects.

The partners took the information for consideration.

4

Tiia Kalske: We are planning to follow up the remarks made by the EUROPARC verification commission in 2008 this year. People in charge are Tiia Kalske and Kurt Wikan (Norway), Natalia Polikarpova and Marina Trusova (Russia), Jyrki Tolonen and Pekka Sulkava (Finland). The report presented by the verifiers has been examined; one should take a closer look at the recommendations made and take a decision what to correct:

A) The goal is clear but it does not show a distinctive character of the region

One should give a definition of the 'key areas'. The Norwegian party will make proposals, inform everybody about them and after that the necessary amendments will be made to the Action Plan.

We can use international standards if we want to add some measurable data. The question is: how are we going to do it? It may be a monitoring of visitors. How are we going to make calculations? It may be the number of publications or something else (the number of visits to our sites, web, visitors centres etc.).

C) Destination, tourist destination. The transition zone and destination are not too clearly

defined. We shall need help from tourist operators.

Buffer zones: map making implies contradictions, this will wait. To begin with one should develop a concept of the buffer zones in every country. There are a lot of zones aimed at different use like forest management, Natura 2000 and so on. We start by describing the different possible buffer zones in every country.

The Norwegian party will make proposals for description on buffer zone for all the parties, but every country have to amend their own national areas that can be included in the future

description.









Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

- E) Recommendations regarding research and monitoring, human factor (f. ex anthropogenic pollution, industries) and its impact on the park's nature as well as impact of hunting, fishing, grazing and ecological trails will be a part of Pasvik programme (monitoring program for anthropogenic impacts on ecosystems). This information can be found in the Chronicles of nature of Pasvik Reserve and in the reports produced by Bioforsk Svanhovd.
- F) Social and economic factors should be controlled or measured; they will be included in some of the projects.
- G) Update of the Action Plan; the proposals will be prepared by the Russian party. All amendments are be made before the next Advisory Board meeting.

### 5.

Jyrki Tolonen: Funding is needed for new projects. We do not need extra mechanisms for dissemination of monitoring outcomes. The next project will last for two years and Finland is willing to be in charge of it. That is why we should collect all the proposals regarding information dissemination and monitoring as well as consider social and economic aspects. We can take some of the actions from the Action Plan after receiving information on funding. Pekka Sulkava will coordinate application activities. We should organize a meeting of experts and to write an application to be able to receive funding.

6.

Jyrki Tolonen thinks that it is important to make a film about the region in the context of information dissemination. The Finnish partners will define goals and forward them to consideration of all the stakeholders and then they will be included in the project.

Vladimir Chizhov: all possibilities should be used: the site, booklets and the film. Cooperation with mass information media is important too. There are different events where one can disseminate information, e.g. The Ski Track of Friendship of Barents region and so on.

Tiia Kalske made a proposal of a trilateral skiing team that can take part in Barents ski event in 2010.

The question of logo use was discussed again. The parties decided to discuss it during the next meeting of the nature tourism group. The atmosphere was that no copy right/ protection is needed, and we should encourage our tourist entrepreneurs to use it also in their work.

On behalf of Pasvik Reserve Marina Trusova thanked Finnmark County Governor Office for promotion of Winter Nature project. The workshop for teachers of Murmansk region will be held in the period from March 17 till March 19, 2009. Norwegian teachers have been invited. It has been planned to make it trilateral, but only Russian teachers will participate in it this year. Norwegian and Finnish teachers can join them later.

Preliminary training was organized for teachers and students; it resulted in a newspaper. One can find children's poetry and a game in it. The latter is a map which gives a virtual possibility to make a trip to the Trilateral Park.

Tiia Kalske welcomed the game, made a proposal to further develop it to different languages (bilingual – trilingual if possible) and produce it. It could be a very nice project that Norway in









Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

future can support financially after further discussions/ application off course, or in the next project as a part of the dissemination work.

Proposal: Finland will be in charge of the site update next year.

7.

Marina Kovtun said that the Trilateral Park was a good resource for product making. It is necessary to make a brand e.g. Child of three countries, Farther is only the Arctic or on the very brink of the earth. The word 'most' is the most valuable in tourism. There should be an element of exclusiveness and uniqueness. The weakest point is a long distance; there is a complicated access and a lack of infrastructure in Russia. The situation cannot be changed within the framework of Interreg-Tacis projects; serious investments are needed as well as a thorough study. But nothing prevents the tourist resource from promotion using the existing mechanisms.

A programme for tourism promotion was developed in Murmansk region in 2008. In cooperation with the local administration it was planned to open a tourist zone in Pechenga district in 2011. We should make some investment areas for investors. There will be conditions made for investors to know the area, but there is no guaranty that an investor will come to the region. But in any case this area is not aimed for mass tourism. Moreover tourism is prohibited in the specially protected natural territories under the Russian legislation in force.

It will be necessary to work with institutions and tourist agencies. Tour operators should take a more active part in the next meetings (take part in the permanent working group on nature tourism).

Jyrki Tolonen thanked for professional advice. Individual groups will be organized in Finland; they find the region themselves without buying vouchers and make a contribution to the economy of Lapland. There was a research made. Piilola Trail is for experienced travellers. The only shop in Nellim will be supported.

Tiia Kalske: municipality of Sør-Varanger, and very professional tour operators in the area and Bioforsk Svanhovd being an information centre for Øvre Pasvik national park deal with these issues in Norway.

Ingvild Wartiainen: One would like to create new economic values in Norway. The tourist association of Sør-Varanger, the municipality and other associations (non-profit organizations e.g. hunting organization) are going to make a join application for funding. It is very important to start developing sustainable nature tourism and have more intensity on information dissemination on nature and activities in Pasvik area.

The population will be proud of the protected areas; both nature and population will be supported. The Action Plan is based on the principals of sustainable nature tourism.

Marina Trusova: Varlam Island is our new project; it should be international. The Norwegian and Finnish parties should be interested in it as the place is of historical importance for the countries. It is a very attractive place for those who are interested in nature tourism and history. One can organize a tour which starts at the Russian-Norwegian border, then a visit is paid to Varlam Island and Rajakoski, then to Virtaniemi and the Finnish part of the park; it ends in









Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

Norway. Thus it will be a round pilot tour as discussed at the previous meetings. We shall try to organize it again for the permanent nature tourism group this year. The most difficult thing is to get permission to cross the border at Virtaniemi check point. If they open it for the pilot tour will be very attractive in future also. There is no doubt that there are a lot of difficulties such as a lack of infrastructure, possibility to close down Virtaniemi and obtaining permission to the border area.

We take all the difficulties into consideration; the tour has very good prospects. In the initial period the project is promoted by the Department for natural and cultural heritage of Norway and Kolskaya GMK.

Marina Kovtun: one can make a proposal to organize a tour for tour operators with international funding provided when ENPI programme starts; in the meantime one can organize a tour for tour operators from Barents region. There is a permanent tourism working group in Barents region. Rune Rafaelsen is in charge of it. It is possible to send an application to an international foundation in order to organize such a tour for the tour operators. Marina Kovtun said that she could make a proposal to organize it for the tourism working group in Barents region in Pasvik-Inari area.

Tiia Kalske: it is a very good proposal. Rune Rafaelsen is in Charge of Norwegian Barents Secretariat. The Norwegian Barents secretariat has annual project funding possibilities, usually with a Norwegian part in the lead to get funds.

Marina Kovtun: Three counties should take an interest in it; it is the most important thing. There is another project; its name is Arctic Europe. Its destination is a progression to the European north. Your proposal can also be included in that project. Proposal: to use mechanisms of different projects.

Olga Makarova being an employee of the reserve is against tourism and interference in natural processes because one should preserve and do research in the reserve. But it will be no good to close Varlam Island for visitors. It is a kind of gift to the reserve which should be used for the benefit of people. Sami, Finns, Norwegians and Russians used to live in that tiny place; then there was World War II. So many events took place there and the island cannot but attract attention. Even Prince Consort Phillip has visited it. There is a multilayer cultural heritage there. What is more the first scientific description was made there in 1907. It was Schaanning's book about birds of East Finnmark. The book 'Birds of Pasvik' was published in 2007. It showed that the number of bird species increased by more than 50. The place is attractive for ornithologists. So it can be a specially oriented tour.

Vladimir Chizhov supported Olga Makarova's ideas. Every year a lot of tourists come to Kirkenes but there are no tourists in Pechenga district that is why there is no progress in Pechenga district. But everything changes. The tour vie three countries was organized for Europark monitors in June 2008 so it has a right to be developed. As for Varlam Island, it is possible to make an exposition containing information on the reserve, the cross border area and cooperation in the ex-frontier post opposite the island.

Vladmir Matveev advised to contact the Ministry for natural resources and the Foreign Office regarding Virtaniemi. If border authorities receive instructions from the agencies mentioned above then the border guards will be engaged in it. As for the border zone in Rajakoski, it will









Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

be there under the law on the National boundary. There are no problems for tourists; they should send an application beforehand in order to get permission; 1,5-2 months before the tour.

Natalia Polikarpova: we need to update the site and place this information there.

Lubov Timokhina thinks that every party of the trilateral park should be interested in opening of Virtaniemi. Six or seven different delegations cross the border in Virtaniemi every year. They get permission from the border authorities.

As for Varlam Island, permission was received in August, in 2008 but we failed to use it due some political events in Russia. We should organize a tour for the permanent tourism group in 2009.

The municipality is authorized to organize recreational areas. There is a café, a community centre, a hostel and a hotel in Rajakoski but some of them are closed down at the moment.

It is a pity that the regional authorities will pay attention to Pechenga district only in 2011.

Pirkko Mäkikokkila, Finnish Consul General in Murmansk thanked Pasvik Reserve for the invitation to participate in the meeting and noted that Russia and Finland had a good cooperation in the cross border issues. Russia and Finland have the following priorities: nature conservation within the framework of international programmes such as Kola Arctic, Northern Dimension and others; forest conservation in Murmansk region; air monitoring technologies are introduced. The Finnish Consul wished further success and strengthening of cooperation.

8.

After some discussion it was decided that the **next meeting of the Advisory Board** would be held in the period from **October 5 till October 7, 2009**. It may take place in Rajakoski. A preparatory group meeting as well as further planning of new project if the financial prospects have improved will be at the same time.

9. A meeting of nature tourism group will be held in Rajakoski in the period from September 21 till September 24, 2009.

10.

The parties came to the conclusion that the main issues regarding the status of the region had been discussed during the meeting.

Jyrki Tolonen: The Finnish party has some extra information.

Piilola Trail will be opened on June 16<sup>th</sup> to 18<sup>th</sup> June, 2009. Joint planning of the vent from Metsähallitus and County Governor, Norway is planning to be represented by the Environmental minister or vice minister, also because this year is the year of cultural heritage in Norway. The programme has not been drawn up yet but there will be nice local food to eat, nice speeches to listen to, a opening ceremony, to day hiking and then closing ceremony and visiting Nellim. Metsähallitus will celebrate its 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary in that period too. The Finnish party is going to organize festivities and is planning to keep everybody informed.









Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

Tiia Kalske: the management plan for Øvre Pasvik National Park is sent for approval to the Directorate for nature management and is awaited to be approved before the summer 2009. Finnmark County Governor Office is in process with many national parks in Finnmark County; Anarjokka area is being extended now; it also works with wetland sites in the whole of Finnmark County and a new national park in the municipality of Kautokeino (Goadalubal).

Question addressed to the Finnish party: At what stage is the project Green Belt of Fennoscandia?

Answer: it is not known.

Question addressed to the Russian party: Is there any information on the intergovernmental agreement between Russia and Norway regarding a common status of Russian-Norwegian Pasvik Reserve?

Vladimir Chizhov: The documents were submitted to the Ministry for natural resources and ecology for endorsement. We asked Foreign Office spokesmen to promote the agreement within the framework of their powers. One will probably have to wait due to internal reorganisation within the agency. We shall contact the persons in charge as soon as the reorganisation is over.

Tiia Kalske: we shall be waiting for your proposals and information.

Vladimir Chizhov thanked everybody for a productive meeting and an open dialogue and informed that an excursion would be organized to Zapolyarny industrial site of Kolskaya GMK at 2 p.m.

The Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik-Inari Trilateral Park was over at 1 p.m. (Moscow time).

## DECISIONS MADE BY THE ADVISORY BOARD

The parties took into consideration the main short-term priorities of the Action Plan. It is necessary to undertake actions for their implementation and to plan implementation of the middle-term actions. A major part of actions should be included in a new project.

The Action Plan should be corrected in accordance with the recommendations provided by the EUROPARC verifiers before the next meeting of the Advisory Board. The parties will communicate by e-mail. The preparatory group will discuss all details and amendments before the next meeting of the Advisory Board. It is necessary to clarify the goal-vision, the key notions such as key territories, buffer zones, transit zones and some others. The Norwegian party is in charge of clarification.

The Russian party has taken the initiative to correct Part B of the Action Plan. It will prepare all the amendments and corrections prior to the next meeting of the Advisory Board. But there will be hearings first.

The preparation of a new project will depend on ENPI instrument funding. In case of a positive decision Finland is willing to coordinate a new two-year project. A group of experts will have a meeting in order to plan it and to prepare an application. The earlier planned activities of the Action Plan should serve as a basis of the application and should have a social and economic context.









Advisory Board meeting of Pasvik – Inari Trilateral Park March 4, 2009; town of Zapolyarny, Russia

The parties will follow information content on the common site www.pasvik-inari.net. They will make amendments or additions if it is necessary as well as publish news and other information but it is a must to contact Finnmark Environmental Department which coordinates the site update in 2008-2009. Finland is asked to take the lead/ be in charge of it from 2010.

Proposal of a trilateral Barents skiing team was brought up, if there is interest it can be fun to take part that day – the arrangement is usually coordinated and implemented by Pasviktursit. The logo use will be discussed during the next meeting of the nature tourism group.

Information dissemination by means of preparing a joint booklet for schoolchildren and a children game has been discussed and taken into consideration.

The parties received a professional consultation on organization of tourism in the region. The Russian party develops Varlam Island as a new resource. The other parties promote it. It is planned to organize a pilot round tour for the tour operators of the region in September 2009. The parties can apply for funding to Barents Secretariat.

The parties will seek to assist in opening of Virtamiemi check point. The Russian party will try to have a dialogue with the Ministry for natural resources and the Foreign Office in order to promote the idea.

The participants of the meeting have exchanged information on tourism development in the region. It is necessary to update the site and to place information on visa and access to Russia.

The next meeting of the Advisory Board will be held in the period from October 5 till October 7, 2009. It may be held in Russia.

The next nature tourism group meeting will take place in the period from September 21 till September 24, 2009 in Rajakoski and a round pilot tour will be organized within its framework.

Referents; Natalia Polikarpova Olga Makarova Marina Trusova Elena Babina

Vladimir Chizov Director Pasvik Zapovednic Jyrki Tolonen Director Lapland Natural Heritage Services Bente Christiansen Director Department of

Environmental Affairs County Governor of

Finnmark







